



Oponentní posudek bakalářské práce

Autor/ka BP:	Helena Klobčič
Název práce:	Forbidden Love: Representation of Attachment Relationship Styles in After (Novel and Movie)
Oponent/ka:	Anna Světlíková

Hodnotící kritéria	Splňuje bez výhrad	Splňuje s drobnými výhradami	Splňuje s výhradami	Nesplňuje
A. Obsahová				
V práci jsou vymezeny základní a dílčí cíle, které jsou v koncepci práce patřičně rozpracovány. Cíle jsou adekvátně naplňovány.			X	
Práce splňuje cíle zadání.			X	
Studující využívá a kriticky vybírá primární a/nebo sekundární literaturu.			X	
Práce má vymezen předmět, je využito odpovídajících metodologických postupů.			X	
Výstupy výzkumných částí jsou adekvátně syntetizovány a je o nich diskutováno.			X	
V práci je využita odborná terminologie a jsou vysvětleny hlavní pojmy.		X		
V práci jsou formulovány jasné závěry, které se vztahují ke koncepci práce a ke stanoveným cílům.		X		
B. Formální				
Práce vykazuje standardní poznámkový aparát a jednotný způsob citací v rámci práce, je typograficky jednotná.			X	
Studující dodržuje jazykovou normu, text je stylisticky jednotný.		X		
Text je soudržný, srozumitelný a argumentačně podložený.			X	
C. Přínos práce *				
			X	

Slovní hodnocení práce:

Ms Klobčič has chosen to approach a work of popular culture, Anna Todd's young adult novel *After* (2014) and its film adaptation, from the perspective of psychology of romantic relationships, particularly from the point of view of attachment theory as applied to such relationships. She presents an overview of attachment theory and typology of attachment styles with a description of how these types are acted out in romantic relationships. Then the candidate considers the narrator of *After*, Tessa, and her relationship with her boyfriend Hardin, from the point of view of the typology of attachments, and identifies Tessa's attachment style to Hardin as anxious, and Hardin's as avoidant, and their relationship as toxic and unhealthy. The author documents this by providing excerpts from the novel and explaining how the characters' behavior corresponds to the behaviors described by attachment theory. Then Ms Klobčič briefly discusses the differences between the novel and the film adaptation. In the final section of her thesis, the candidate suggests that the novel and the movie might inspire young adult audiences to seek unhealthy relationships rather than warn them of those.

In the first part of her thesis Ms Klobčič presents a well-written, clear overview of attachment theory and its application to romantic relationships. She also defines what unhealthy relationships are from this perspective and why it is that they are harmful to those involved in them. This orderly, clear focus and structure loosens somewhat in the second part of the thesis where the candidate gives a characterization of Tessa and her relationship to Hardin, provides a selection of six excerpts from the novel and comments on them from the perspective of attachment typology. Although the comments are clear and relevant, the combination of quotations, summaries, paraphrases and the author's explanation creates a somewhat confusing impression, not least because the typographical conventions for quoting according to the required citation style are not maintained (block quotations are not indented and separated by blank lines).

The author's choice of her selections is one of weak points of the thesis. She justifies her choice by giving three criteria (scenes which happen in the novel and in the movie, excerpts which show the characters' attachment style, excerpts which show that Tessa and Hardin's relationship is unhealthy; p. 39). While these are logical criteria, the reader unfamiliar with the novel is left to wonder whether there might be other passages in the text that might show other aspects of the relationship and attachment, and whether, consequently, the author's choice might not be biased in favor of her own argument. It might be that the author's choice presents an accurate depiction of the characters and their relationship but it would have been advisable for the author to state explicitly that these excerpts are an accurate and balanced representation (if this is the case), or, if there are passages in the novel which might show some more mature aspects of the characters' attachment and their relationship, why those are not considered.

Secondly, the candidate's aim to consider both the novel and the film adaptation creates some misbalance in her analysis. She devotes far more attention to the novel than to the film, so that the reader gets a much more in-depth analysis of the former and just a short discussion of the latter. The author explains that the characters' relationship is presented as much less toxic in the movie than in the novel and that the character of Hardin is not only less abusive but even undergoes some positive development, providing the movie with a hopeful ending. From this I would conclude that the impact of the film on young adult audiences would be different from the impact of the novel, yet the author only comments that "neither the original nor the movie version offers a reflection that calls out specific unhealthy tendencies in their relationship and calls them unhealthy" (p. 53). Would the relationship and the characters' attachment styles fall in the same categories as those in the book? This is not explicitly addressed. Because the film is not discussed in much depth, the reader also wonders about the validity of the author's first criterion for the choice of excerpts from the novel: why was it important to choose those parts that occur both in the novel and in the film when the film is treated in a much more cursory way?

The response of readers and viewers is another topic that is merely touched upon in a somewhat haphazard way. I understand that it would be beyond the scope of the thesis to analyze fan commentaries and other responses in social media but the author should at least explicitly say so to show that she is aware of this dimension of the issue. As it is, she presents a few enthusiastic quotations by *After* fans but does not inform the reader whether these reflect the prevalent view that one might come across or whether some readers/viewers actually see Tessa and Hardin's relationship critically or whether there might be differences between the responses of the readers of the novel and the viewers of the film.

The writing is fluent, the language level appropriate with just occasional mistakes. The bibliography presents an impressive selection of secondary sources from psychology and social sciences but virtually no sources related to the context of young adult literature. The author adds an appendix to her thesis, a questionnaire for assessment of attachment styles; however, she does not provide any explanation for the questionnaire and how it is to be interpreted (e.g., what are "A, B, C").

On the whole, I find the first part of the thesis to be the strongest, with clear arguments, a good use of secondary sources properly quoted and referred to, while the second and the third part of the thesis would have needed some more work to make the focus sharper, more balanced and better justified, the citations less confusing, and the argumentation more clearly articulated.

Práce splňuje požadavky na udělení akademického titulu Bc.:

ano

Práci doporučuji k obhajobě:

ano

Návrh klasifikačního stupně:

velmi dobře minus

Náměty pro obhajobu:

Questions for the defence:

1. You have called your thesis "Forbidden Love." In your thesis, you do not explain your choice of the title in any way. What is "forbidden" about the love of Tessa and Hardin? What ideas have you tried to capture by that title?
2. Commenting on the differences between the film and the novel with respect to the relationship of Tessa and Hardin, you say that "the book cannot cover the toxicity of their relationship as it cannot use the same techniques as a movie can" (p. 51). To me this sounds unclear: why *could* or *could not* the novel "cover" the toxicity? The novel *creates* the toxic relationship; there is no real Tessa and Hardin that the novel would try to make look better than in reality. If the film presents their relationship in a more romantic way, as you say, by playing romantic music and showing the characters more frequently in "standard" romantic situations and less in fights than the book, is it really a question of film techniques as such, or a decision of the film makers to alter or "soften" the relationship between Tessa and Hardin?
3. The thesis pivots on the assumption that books or films for adolescent audiences should present them with good examples which will promote their wellbeing, or present them with negative examples clearly identified as such. In your conclusion, you say: "Healthy attachment and healthy relationships . . . should be promoted. At the same time, books or shows showing unhealthy relationships should offer a reflection on these relationships and show warning against them rather than romanticising the abuse and portraying it as

passion” (p. 56). Who decides this? How far can authors go in this direction without becoming unbearably didactic and moralizing (after all, here the target audiences are young adults who might not want to be told what to do). (This is not an attack on your premise; rather an open question to invite some more thoughts.)

Datum: 8. června 2024

Podpis: _____